Three-Month’s Toll of the Ongoing Offensive on Eastern Ghouta

More Escalation and Violated Agreements

SYRIAN NETWORK FOR HUMAN RIGHTS
الشبكة السورية لحقوق الإنسان

Friday, February 16, 2018
The Syrian Network for Human Rights (SNHR), founded in June 2011, is a non-governmental, independent group that is considered a primary source for the OHCHR on all death toll-related analyses in Syria.

Contents
I. Introduction
II. Executive Summary
III. Details
IV. Conclusions and Recommendations

I. Introduction
The Syrian-Iranian alliance’s air and land attacks on Eastern Ghouta, which has been suffocating under an excessive siege since October 19, 2013, continues as the offensive enters its fourth month, with no signs of stopping in sight. The attacking forces didn’t respect any rules of the law of war, but, rather, used chemical weapons and deliberately targeted medical facilities. We have recorded that some medical facilities were targeted more than once, which is an unprecedented occurrence in the history of contemporary warfare. In light of the targeting of medical and educational facilities, it is laughable to talk about a Russian guarantor, or bilateral agreements, or peace talk, or the international law, or the Security Council after 90 have passed during which the bombardment, killing, and destruction almost never stopped. An important thing to consider is that approximately 350,000 civilians, including children and women, live in the besieged area. Some of those died from starvation and illnesses. SNHR possesses a record that contains list of names who have fallen victims to the siege and the bombardment, as well as the details of the attacks that have been carried out. This report will only include some of these attacks for the sake of avoiding unhelpful repetition.

We have shed light in two past reports on the most notable violations of human rights by the Syrian-Russian alliance in Eastern Ghouta since the last escalation the offensive saw in the area. We’ve also released a report on a similar offensive by Syrian-Russian alliance forces in Idlib governorate which is also included in the de-escalation agreement.

Despite all of the international calls to cease fire and allow the passage of humanitarian aids, and the agreements that have been struck and explicitly provided for putting an end to the siege on Eastern Ghouta, immediately evacuating all the wounded, and allow passage for aid convoys, we have yet to record, as of Tuesday, February 13, 2018, the entrance of any
humanitarian aid convoys to Eastern Ghouta since September 24, 2017. In addition, the Syrian regime obstructed the evacuation of any critical cases since December 29, 2017. In light of the siege and the heavy bombardment recently, we have recorded a relative rise in the number of deaths of illness and starvation due to the limited medical capabilities.

Ursula Mueller, the United Nations Assistant Secretary-General for Humanitarian Affairs, spoke at a Security Council session that was held on January 30, 2018, about the situation in Eastern Ghouta, casting a light on 21 dead individuals who were among the people that need to be evacuated from Eastern Ghouta to be treated.

The escalated violence had a very clear toll on children, who compromise a significant portion of Eastern Ghouta’s population, where this manifested in them being deprived of their very basic rights. Human Rights Watch outlined this in a report, released on January 11, 2018, that was entitled: “Children Under Attack in Damascus Enclave” in which the group called on the Security Council to act on the situation in Eastern Ghouta and protect its children.

On January 14, 2018, Fran Equiza, UNICEF representative in Syria, addressed, in an official statement, the death of 30 children in Syria in 2018’s first 15 days in Eastern Ghouta, describing the situation as “shocking”. The statement called for taking more action to support the children in the besieged areas of Syria.

As the pace of military attacks on the various areas that are outside the Syrian regime’s control has been on a rise since the start of 2018 which was in parallel with increased rates of killing and deteriorating humanitarian situations, the United Nations, on Tuesday, February 6, 2018, called for “an immediate cessation of hostilities lasting for at least one month throughout Syria to enable the delivery of humanitarian aid and services, evacuation of the critically sick and wounded, and alleviation of people’s suffering.”

Moreover, Zeid Ra’ad Al Hussein, the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, called, on February 10, 2018, for “urgent international action after a week of soaring violence and bloodshed, mostly caused by airstrikes, in the opposition-held Eastern Ghouta and Idlib regions of Syria.”

**Methodology**

This report outlines the incidents that were documented between January 11, 2018, and February 14, 2018, in addition to incidents that took place in the preceding period that was covered in the two past reports, but weren’t included as they were still being investigated. The report highlights the most notable of these incidents. We have the complete details of all incidents stored in SNHR’s database.
In the course of the ongoing monitoring for incidents and developments by SNHR team through a wide network including tens of various sources that have been built over an accumulation of extensive relations since the start of our work. When we receive information, or hear some news about a violation via the internet or media outlets, we work on following-up on this news and try to verify and collect evidences and data. In some cases, the researcher is able to visit the incident location at the soonest. However, this is a rarity in light of the incredibly high security risks, and given the frequency of daily incidents and in light of the human and material resources at hand. Therefore, the possibility to access evidences vary from one case to another, and, hence, the degree of its classification. Usually, what we do, at SNHR, in such cases is relying on accounts from survivors who experience the violation firsthand, where we try to access those directly, and, to a second degree, who saw or filmed the violation, in addition to analyzing available materials from open sources such as the internet and media outlets. Thirdly, we try to speak to medical personnel who treated the wounded, assessed the symptoms, and determined the cause of death.

Please see the methodology adopted by SNHR for documenting victims and classifying vital civilian facilities.

This report contains seven accounts that were collected through speaking directly with eyewitnesses, and are not cited from any open sources. We have explained the purpose of these interviews to the eyewitnesses who gave us permission to use the information they provided in this report without offering or giving them any incentives. SNHR has tried to spare the eyewitnesses the agony of remembering the violation, and gave guarantees to conceal the identity of any witnesses who preferred to use an alias.

Furthermore, the investigations included in this report have proved that the targeted areas were civilian areas where no military centers or armories for armed opposition factions or extremist Islamic groups were found before or during the attack. Also, Syrian/Russian forces didn’t alert the civilians prior to the attacks as the international humanitarian law requires. SNHR has analyzed the videos and pictures that were posted online, or were sent to us by local activists via e-mail, Skype, or social media. Some of the videos published by activists show the location of the attacks, the dead bodies, the injured, and the huge destruction in the aftermath of the bombardment.

This report only represents the bare minimum, which we were able to document, of the magnitude and severity of the violation that occurred. It also doesn’t cover the social, economic, and mental ramifications.
II. Executive Summary

This report outlines the most notable violations of human rights by Syrian-Russian alliance forces in the armed opposition-held Eastern Ghouta, Damascus suburbs governorate between November 14, 2018, and February 14, 2018, through bombardment and starvation.

![Infographic showing human rights violations](image)

Massacres and other acts of unlawful killing

- **697 civilians**
- **97** civilian deaths
- **177** civilian injuries
- **67** injuries
- **185** Russian forces
- **109** Syrian Regime forces
- **118** were killed

Attacks on vital civilian facilities

- **10** attacks on schools
- **11** attacks on hospitals
- **32** attacks on water systems
- **28** attacks on power plants

Attacks on vital civilian facilities

- **3** attacks on media
- **4** attacks on aid organizations
- **1** attack on churches

Siege

- **18** civilians
- **1** woman
- **2** children

No less than **18** civilians died due to lack of food and medications in light of the siege imposed by Syrian regime forces.

According to SNHR documentation
A. Massacres and other acts of unlawful killing: We have recorded the killing of 729 civilians, including 185 children, 109 women (adult female), seven civil defense members, 10 medical personnel, and one media worker. We have also recorded no less than 40 massacres. Violations are distributed as follows:

- Syrian regime forces: killed 697 civilians, including 177 children, 96 women, six civil defense members, 10 medical personnel, and one media worker. Additionally, Syrian regime forces committed 37 massacres.
- Russian forces: killed 32 civilians, including eight children, 13 women, and one civil defense member. Additionally, Russian forces committed three massacres.

B. Attacks on vital civilian facilities: We have documented no less than 108 attacks on vital civilian facilities at the hands of Syrian regime forces, as follows: 28 mosques, 10 medical facilities, 32 local markets, 11 schools, three kindergartens, one orphanage, 13 vehicles belonging to the civil defense, two facilities belonging to the Red Crescent, four official headquarters, one church, one ambulance, one university, and one institute.

C. Unlawful attacks: We have recorded four attacks using cluster munitions, three attacks using poison gases, and one attack using incendiary weapons at the hands of Syrian regime forces.

D. Siege: We have recorded, among the victims, eight civilians, including two children and one woman, who died due to food and medication shortages in light of the siege enforced by Syrian regime forces in the region during the period of time covered by the report.

III. Details
A. Most notable massacres and other acts of unlawful killing
Monday, February 5, 2018, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles at the local market in Beit Sawa town, which resulted in the killing of nine civilians, including two children and two women.
Tuesday, February 6, 2018, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles at the residential neighborhoods in Irbeen city, which resulted in the killing of 14 civilians, including four children, five women, and the nurse Mohannad Halis who worked at Irbeen Surgical Hospital.

Tuesday, February 6, 2018, around 12:00, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles, in parallel with an artillery shelling by Syrian regime forces artillery, at the residential neighborhoods in Douma city, which resulted in the killing of 32 civilians, including five children and 11 women.

We contacted Baraa Abu Ziad, a resident in Douma city, who told us he heard an artillery shelling on the city around 10:00 when he was visiting a relative of his. The shelling was followed by a number of airstrikes on the city: “Around 13:00, we learned that there are people trapped under the rubble of their building. I headed there where I saw civil defense members trying to pull out people who trapped under a destroyed building, which was a four-building building, I believe. I met there one of my acquaintances who told me that his brother’s wife, who was visiting her family “Kabrita” in this building, was trapped under the rubble.” Baraa added that rescue operations was still going on, but he returned to his home at 17:00 as the artillery shelling on the city was resumed.

1 We contacted him via Facebook on February 13, 2018
Wednesday, February 7, 2018, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles at Beit Sawa town, which resulted in the killing of 10 civilians, including five children.

Wednesday, February 7, 2018, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles at Hamouriya town, which resulted in the killing of 11 civilians, including six children and one woman.

Thursday, February 8, 2018, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles at the residential neighborhoods in Jisreen town, which resulted in the killing of 17 civilians, including three children and six women.
Thursday, February 8, 2018, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles at Irbeen city, which resulted in the killing of 31 civilians, including 10 children, four women, and the paramedic Fawwaz al Rankousi who worked at Irbeen Surgical Hospital while he was tending to the wounded from a previous shelling.

We contacted Anas al Ta’an², a civil defense volunteer, who told us that the observatories announced that a Sukhoi-24 warplane took off and it is heading towards Ghouta, so the civil defense was standing by for any airstrike: “Around 15:00, the warplanes bombed the center of the city, so we headed there and the sight was horrifying. Dead bodies were scattered everywhere, and goods from the markets were spread everywhere. Due to the huge number of victims and wounded, we had to put five of them in each ambulance. I couldn’t count the number of martyrs on the day because the bombing never stopped.”

Anas added that most of the wounded were women and children: “The warplane bombed the market with four missiles, each missile landed 30 meters away from the other. I can’t measure the destruction, as the shelling lasted for days.”

---

² We contacted him via Telegram on February 13, 2018
B. Most notable attacks on vital civilian facilities

Syrian regime forces

Places of worship

- Mosques

Monday, January 22, 2018, around 12:00, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a missile at the Grand Mosque in the middle of Irbeen city. The mosque building was partially destroyed and its furniture and cladding materials were heavily damaged, as the mosque was temporarily rendered out of commission.
Thursday, February 8, 2018, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a missile at al Noor Mosque in eastern Saqba city. The mosque building was partially destroyed and its furniture was heavily damaged, as the mosque was rendered out of commission.

-Churches and monasteries
Thursday, February 8, 2018, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles near the Saint George Orthodox Church in Irbeen city. The church building was partially destroyed and its furniture was heavily damaged.
Vital educational facilities

- Schools

Wednesday, February 7, 2018, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles at Hamouriya High School for Boys in Hamouriya town. The school building was partially destroyed and its furniture was moderately damaged.

![Destruction in one of the classrooms in Hamouriya High School for Boys in the aftermath of a bombing by Syrian regime forces – February 7, 2018](image)

Sunday, February 11, 2018, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles at Mahmoud Khalaf Intermediate School in Hamouriya town. The school building was partially destroyed and its furniture was slightly damaged.

- Universities

Friday, February 9, 2018, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles at a building that contains the faculty of economics and the electronical institute which are affiliated to Aleppo Free University in Irbeen city. The building was heavily destroyed and its furniture was heavily damaged, as the building was rendered out of commission. It should be noted that Aleppo “Free” University occupies Abdul al Mun'em Ryad High School building in Irbeen city as a base for its faculty of economics and electronical institute.
Tuesday, February 6, 2018, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles at Women Now Center for Development, which offers vocational and educational courses for women, in Kafr Batna town. The center building was partially destroyed and its furniture was heavily damaged.

Women Now Organization released a statement on the same day about the incident. Safaa Harah³, director of Women Now Center, told us that a usual workday ends at 12:00, but the heavy bombing forced them to leave at 10:00: “After I arrived home, the neighbors of the center called me to tell me that two missiles landed next to the center and destroyed most of the walls and the wooden separators between the rooms. They also sent me pictures of the place.” Safaa contacted one of the teachers that lives near the center, and her husband went to check and see if there is any retrievable equipment: “The center is two joined apartment on the first floor and two rooms on the second floor. The center offers various programs for women on economic empowerment and mental and social support, in addition to other educational courses and other activities. The damages to the center was too steep. The nursing room, the shaving room, the computer room, and the yard were all destroyed. It is impossible to restore the center to its former state now.”

³ We contacted her via Facebook on February 14, 2018
Tuesday morning, February 6, 2018, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles at the Teachers’ Union Kindergarten for Kids in the middle of Kafr Batna town. The kindergarten building was partially destroyed and its furniture was moderately damaged. Anas Abu Ayman⁴, a media worker in Kafr Batna, told us that around 10:00, morning of February 6, one of the neighborhoods in southwestern Kafr Batna town was targeted by an airstrike carried out by Syrian regime warplanes. The airstrike resulted in a massacre, and was followed by another one about an hour later, where two missiles landed in the middle of the town: “I headed with the paramedics and civil defense members to the site (the public street) and saw the huge destruction to the Teachers’ Union Kindergarten which was directly hit by the missile, while the second missile landed on a house and two wounded persons were evacuated from the rubble,” Anas said that the offensive that started three months ago have brought the educational process to a complete halt in Eastern Ghouta: “This airstrike killed two individuals while about 70 were wounded. Also, Women Now Center was heavily damaged in the same airstrike.”

⁴ We contacted him via WhatsApp on February 13, 2018
Vital medical facilities
- Medical facilities
Tuesday, February 6, 2018, around 13:30, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a missile near Beit Sawa Medical Complex, known as the dispensary, in the center of Beit Sawa town. The complex building and its equipment were heavily damaged, as the complex was temporarily rendered out of commission.

Tuesday, February 6, 2018, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles at Inqath Rouh Psychiatric Center in Kafr Batna town. The center building was partially destroyed and its equipment and cladding materials were heavily damaged, as the center was rendered out of commission. It should be noted that this was the only operational center for psychiatric illness in Eastern Ghouta.

Communal facilities
- Markets
Thursday, February 1, 2018, around 11:00, Syrian regime forces artillery fired a number of shells at a local market in Douma city. A number of shops and market facilities were heavily damaged.
Tuesday, February 6, 2018, around 13:00, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a missile at a local market in the middle of Kafr Batna town. A number of shops were heavily destroyed.
International humanitarian insignia

- Red Crescent

Thursday, February 8, 2018, around 14:30, fixed-wing Syrian regime forces warplanes fired a number of missiles at the Syrian Arab Red Crescent center in Irbeen city. The center building was partially destroyed, and its equipment was heavily damaged, as the center was rendered out of commission. It should be noted that the Syrian Arab Red Crescent organization occupies the former recruitment facility as a base.

We contacted a worker at the center who preferred to conceal his name. The worker told us that they were charged with distribute complimentary food meals for kids with malnutrition, as well as the regular milk distribution according to the lists: “The distribution was scheduled between 13:00 and 15:00. While people were queuing, we started hearing the bombing on relatively far locations, but we carried on, as children were in need of food, and also we got used to the continued bombing. However, the center was directly hit with a missile around 14:30. At that time, there were five people queuing and five members of the Red Crescent. Most of them sustained bruises.” The worker added that the bombing didn’t stop and the warplanes returned to target the center and its vicinities in four airstrikes within one hour: “The facility contains a vaccination center and a center for malnutrition, as well as a center for crisis management. The building and equipment were partially destroyed, and the Red Crescent point is currently out of commission.”

---

5 We contacted him via Facebook on February 13, 2018
**Infrastructures**

- **Civil defense facilities**
  Saturday, January 20, 2018, Syrian regime forces artillery fired a shell near an ambulance belonging to the civil defense’s center 200 in Douma city. A civil defense member was killed, while another member was wounded. Additionally, the vehicle’s frontal structure was moderately damaged.

  Tuesday, February 6, 2018, Syrian regime forces artillery fired a shell that landed near an ambulance belonging to the civil defense’s center 114 in al Nashabiya town in al Marj area. The ambulance was heavily damaged and was rendered out of commission.

- **Official headquarters**
  Saturday, January 13, 2018, around 17:20, Syrian regime rocket launchers fired surface-to-surface rockets on a garage for the local council in Douma city. The garage was heavily destroyed, as it was rendered out of commission.
  The local council released on a statement on January 20, 2018, condemning the incident.
C. Unlawful attacks

- Poison gases

Monday, January 22, 2018, between 05:30 and 06:00, Syrian regime forces rocket launchers fired no less than three surface-to-surface rockets loaded with poison gases. The shelling targeted the residential neighborhoods in western Douma city. At least 18 individuals were injured, including three children. The injured exhibited symptoms that included dyspnea, agitation, and sweating.

Doctor Yasser, the managing director of Rif Dimshaq Hospital, told us that he examined a number of cases including women, children, and men who were suffering from dyspnea: “Some of the injured suffered from dyspnea, agitation, and sweating, while others exhibited crepitation sounds when we examined their chest. We didn’t encounter any mydriasis cases, as tests showed their pupils reacted to light. We provided first-aid and treatment by supporting their breathing and giving them Bronchodilators.”

![Remnants of rockets, allegedly loaded with poison substances, that were found after an attack by Syrian regime forces on Douma city, January 22, 2018]

---

6 We contacted him via WhatsApp
Incendiary ammunitions

Sunday, January 28, 2018, Syrian regime forces fired no less than nine surface-to-surface rockets that were loaded with an incendiary material in the middle of Harasta city. Four civilians sustained burns, while no less than 10 others suffered from suffocation due to the fires that were caused by the rockets.

Abu Ahmad Omar⁷, a member of the Media Officer in Harasta city, told us that he heard the whistle of 10 rockets that are commonly known as Pheel rockets. Abu Ahmad added that her sound, however, was weak and it didn’t cause the explosion they usually do: “That was around 17:00 when most of the city residents were hiding in shelters due to the heavy airstrikes that we have been seeing since morning that day. After the Pheel rockets landed, I left the shelter and found fires in a number of residential buildings. The rocket were loaded with napalm. I counted about 45 points that saw fires between residential buildings and cars.” Abu Ahmad said that civil defense teams tried to put out the fires with water, but they were growing stronger, so they used dirt: “These rockets resulted in balls of flame that scattered across houses and neighborhoods. I saw spots that were on fire on the roadway. Some fires lasted for more than 24 hours. The fires erupted in my house and I couldn’t put it out as of today.”

IV. Conclusions and Recommendations

1- The Syrian-Iranian alliance forces have, beyond any doubt, violated Security Council Resolutions 2139 and 2254 which both state that indiscriminate attacks must be ceased. Also, these forces have violated Articles 7 and 8 of Rome Statute through the act of willful killing which constitutes war crimes.
2- We can confirm that the bombardment mentioned in this report has targeted defenseless civilians. Therefore, Syrian forces have violated the rules of the international human rights law which guarantee the right to life. Additionally, these violations were perpetrated in a non-international armed conflict which amount to a war crime where all elements were fulfilled.
3- The attacks mentioned in this report, which were carried out by the Syrian regime, are considered a violation of the customary international law as the shells were fired at a populated area rather than a specific military object.
4- Aerial bombardment has caused collateral damages that involved loss of lives, injuries, and significant damages to civil facilities. There are strong indicators suggesting that the damage was too excessive compared to the anticipated military benefit.

⁷ We contacted him via Telegram on January 29, 2018
5. Syrian regime forces have breached, through the use of chemical weapons, Security Council resolutions 2118, 2209, and 2235. Also, these forces have breached the CWC which the Syrian government acceded to in September 2013.

Recommendations

Security Council
• The Security Council has to take additional steps after Resolution 2254 was adopted, which states: “Demands that all parties immediately cease any attacks against civilians and civilian objects as such, including attacks against medical facilities and personnel, and any indiscriminate use of weapons, including through shelling and aerial bombardment.”
• The Syrian case should be referred to the International Criminal Court and all those who are responsible should be held accountable including the Russian regime whose involvement in war crimes has been proven.
• Instill security and peace in Syria and implement the norm of the Responsibility to Protect in order to protect the lives, culture, and history of the Syrian people from being destroyed, looted, and ruined.
• Expand the sanctions to include the Syrian, Russian, and Iranian regimes who are directly involved in committing crimes against humanity and war crimes against the Syrian people.

International Community
• In light of the split of the Security Council and its utter inability, steps should be taken on the national and regional levels to form alliances to support the Syrian people that would protect them from the daily killing and siege and enhance the support for the relief efforts. Additionally, the principle of universal jurisdiction must be activated in local courts regarding these crimes in order to conduct fair trials for all those who were involved.
• SNHR has repeatedly called for the implementation of the “Responsibility to Protect” in tens of studies and reports and as a member of the International Coalition for the Responsibility to Protect (ICRtoP) after all political channels through the Arab League’s plan and then Mr. Kofi Annan’s plan have been consumed, as well as the Cessation of Hostilities statements and Astana agreements that followed. Therefore, steps under Chapter VII of the Charter of the United Nations should be taken and the norm of the “Responsibility to Protect”, which was established by the United Nations General Assembly, should be implemented. The Security Council is still hindering the protection of civilians in Syria.
• Renew the pressure on the Security Council to refer the case in Syria to the International Criminal Court
• Work on fulfilling justice and achieving accountability in Syria through the United Nations General Assembly and the Human Rights Council and work on activating the principle of the universal jurisdiction.

**OHCHR**
The OHCHR should submit a report to the Human Rights Council and other organs of the United Nations on the incidents mentioned in this report.

**United Nations special envoy to Syria**
• Expand Security Council briefings rather than only limiting them to the violations of al-Nussra Front and ISIS
• Condemn the perpetrators of the crimes, the massacres, and those who were primarily responsible for shattering the de-escalation agreements.

**The Russian regime**
• Apply pressure on its ally, the Syrian regime, in order to completely cease bombing hospitals, protected civilian objects, and civilian areas.
• Apply pressure on the Syrian regime to cease all indiscriminate attacks, and allow unconditional passage for humanitarian aids into Eastern Ghouta.

**Acknowledgment and Condolences**
Our most heartfelt gratitude and condolences to all the residents and local activists who contributed effectively to this report.